

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

**Recommendation to approve \$29,729 in design alternative studies for the Vanderbilt Beach park/restroom facility as directed at the March 8, 2011 BCC meeting and request authorization for associated budget amendments.**

---

**OBJECTIVE:** Obtain approval for expenditures for the design alternative studies for the Vanderbilt Beach park/restroom facility as directed at the March 8, 2011 BCC meeting.

**CONSIDERATIONS:** The existing Vanderbilt Beach restrooms are approximately 15 years old, in need of significant refurbishment and are undersized to meet current public demands. Vanderbilt Beach is one of the County's most popular beach parks. Adequate beach parking exists at this location with the County's parking garage on Vanderbilt Beach Road.

The proposed Vanderbilt Beach park/restroom facility design engineering, permitting and construction contract bidding was approved by the BCC on 7/27/2010 (Item 16D9) for \$160,000 to address overall community needs consistent with current County practices and existing beach park facilities.

The BCC directed staff on March 8, 2011 to develop alternatives to constructing an elevated restroom, deck and concession park facility at the current FEMA VE 14 location. Options requested were:

1. Renovate existing facility – Utilizing the appraisal and structural inspection of the existing facility, develop a conceptual plan and evaluate the options to renovate the existing facility.
2. Design a new flood proofed facility at grade in proposed AE zone – Develop conceptual design and overall facility cost for an at-grade facility, flood proofed for the new proposed AE zone. This would require this facility to be built farther off the beach and not in the footprint of the existing facility. This is a preserve area.
3. Refurbish the existing bathroom and expand bathrooms in garage as needed for capacity - Evaluate if this is possible due to code restrictions and if possible, determine how much the existing facility can be refurbished (task1) and develop conceptual layout for bathrooms in the parking garage. Included would be a walkway through the preserve.
4. Construct a new facility at grade in the existing bathroom footprint (VE14). – If FEMA guidelines were ignored, what would a new facility conceptual layout/cost be? This would include the demolition of the existing facility, design and build new restrooms, ADA accessible ramp, steps and a reduced deck.
5. Construct a new elevated facility – Develop a conceptual plan and options to demolish the existing facility and construct a new elevated facility to conform to VE 14 FEMA guidelines. This would include the restrooms, a small deck and either an elevator or ADA access ramps.

6. Renovate existing facility for concession storage – In conjunction with a new bathroom facility, develop a conceptual plan to renovate the existing bathroom for concession storage. This would include storage for chairs, umbrellas, shade structures, etc. but exclude food and beverage items.
7. The Growth Management Division will also determine:
  - The City of Naples history/circumstances surrounding FEMA flood variances granted within the City especially the Port Royal variance.
  - Determine if a Letter of Map Revision (LOMR) is appropriate to qualify this specific site to an AE zone based on actual site elevations provided by Coastal Zone Management.

These options will not be consistent with the existing County beach park facilities at Tigertail, Clam Pass or Barefoot Beach Park. Each of these facilities has concessions and are elevated. Staff will be required to review these options with the Pelican Bay Foundation. The Pelican Bay Foundation holds restrictive covenants on this parcel as a condition of the property deed transfer. These options will also be reviewed with community organizations throughout the County as well as the Parks and Recreation Advisory Board, the Coastal Advisory Committee and the Tourist Development Council.

Cost to develop these design options are as follows:

1. Renovate existing facility -	\$ 1,810
2. New facility in proposed AE zone -	\$ 7,169
3. Refurbish existing bathroom and add bathrooms in garage-	\$ 3,414
4. Construct reduced facility at grade in VE zone -	\$ 3,729
5. Construct reduced elevated facility in VE zone -	\$ 3,076
6. Renovate existing bathroom for concession storage -	\$ 980
7. Coordination -	\$ 1,970
8. BCC Presentations -	\$ 3,885
9. Contingencies -	\$ 3,466
10. Reimbursable -	\$ 230
Total	\$29,729

Overall project costs along with design throwaway costs for each option will be presented with each item.

**ADVISORY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS:** The Coastal Advisory Committee on the April 14, 2011 meeting voted 9-0 against this motion. Their position is that the original design is consistent with County policy and other facilities and has been completely vetted and approved by the BCC and meets FEMA standards for this location.

This item will be presented to the Park & Recreation Advisory Committee on April 20, 2011.

**FISCAL IMPACT:** The cost of this option development will be \$29,729. All funds will be provided from Category "A" Tourist Development Tax Fund 183 – Beach Park Facilities.

A budget amendment will be required to allocate the necessary funds from Fund 183 reserves.

**GROWTH MANAGEMENT IMPACT:** There is no impact to the Growth Management Plan related to this action. This study will identify specific impacts, if any each option would present to the Growth Management Plan.

**LEGAL CONSIDERATIONS:** This item has been reviewed by the County Attorney's Office, requires majority vote, and is legally sufficient for Board action. – CMG

**RECOMMENDATION:** Approve \$29,729 in design alternative studies for the Vanderbilt Beach park/restroom facility as directed at the March 8, 2011 BCC meeting and authorize associated budget amendments.

**PREPARED BY: Gary McAlpin – Director, Coastal Zone Management**

**McAlpinGary**

---

**From:** MottToni  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 31, 2011 9:24 AM  
**To:** McAlpinGary  
**Cc:** NoonanDick; LeonardRoosevelt  
**Subject:** FW: Public bathrooms at the end of Vanderbilt Beach Road

Gary,

Per the email chain below, we called Jim for clarification, but he is out of the office for a week. I spoke to Dick Noonan, Building Inspector, CC Building Review & Permitting. Dick said that the Property Appraiser's assessed value can be utilized or we can obtain a value from a licensed property appraiser. Whichever is higher is used for the 50% calculation. Roosevelt is a licensed property appraiser. Dick also said that FEMA will accept a 20% add on to the appraised value. With that being said, please see the information below:

**Property Appraiser Assessed Value:**

Bath House \$17,066  
W Deck \$1,474  
TOTAL: \$18,540 + 20% (\$3,708) = \$22,248 and 50% = \$11,124

**Roosevelt's Insured Cost Replacement Value:**

Bath House & W Deck - \$28,000 + 20% (\$5,600) = \$33,600 - 50% = \$16,800

Please note that the Property Appraiser is the only one that can provide an "assessed value." A licensed property appraiser can only provide "market value" or "cost value." Typically market value is higher than assessed value, but lower than cost value. It is our suggestion that we use the cost value because it is the cost we currently have insured with Risk Management and is the highest value obtainable with all three approaches. The cost value is fully defensible.

Below is the LDC that references the 50% provision. Please let us know if you require any additional information from us.

Thank you.

Toni & Roosevelt

**LDC 5.05.08.B.3. Architectural and Site Design Standards (see highlighted)**

**B.**

*Applicability.* The provisions of section 5.05.08 apply:

1. To all new buildings and projects submitted on or after November 10, 2004 in the zoning districts set out below. At the applicant's request, projects submitted between November 10, 2004 and January 2, 2005 may be reviewed for compliance with the requirements of section 5.05.08 as they were set forth in the LDC before November 10, 2004.
  - a. Commercial zoning districts.
  - b. Non-residential PUD districts, and non-residential components of any PUD district.
  - c. Business park districts.

2.

April 25, 2011

New Business 7 - a

To non-residential buildings and projects submitted on or after November 10, 2004 in any zoning district, but only when the following conditions exist:

- a. The project site is located on an arterial or collector road, as described by the Traffic Circulation Element of the GMP, or
- b. A proposed building's footprint would be located within 300 feet of the boundary of a residentially zoned district.

3.

To all renovations and redevelopment, including applicable additions of a building or site, as follows, except that "renovation" is not intended to apply to routine repairs and maintenance of an existing building:

- a. Any addition or renovation of an existing building or project including vehicular use area (i.e. - approved for use and occupancy as of November 10, 2004) that will result in a change to the exterior of the building or site such that in the case of:
  - i. A building facade renovation where such addition, renovation, or redevelopment exceeds 50 percent of the wall area of an existing facade, that entire facade must comply with the standards of Section 5.05.08.
  - ii. An addition or renovation to, or redevelopment of, an existing building or project, where the cost of such addition, renovation, or redevelopment exceeds 50 percent of the assessed value of the existing structure(s), or would exceed 25 percent of the square footage of the gross area of the existing structures, the existing building(s) and the site improvements must conform with the standards of Section 5.05.08.
  - iii. Upon repainting an existing building, the colors to be applied must comply with Section 5.05.08 C.13. Materials and colors.

---

**From:** LorenzWilliam  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 31, 2011 8:13 AM  
**To:** ValeraCarolina; MottToni  
**Cc:** BellowsRay; BosiMichael; WileyRobert; TurnerJim  
**Subject:** RE: Public bathrooms at the end of Vanderbilt Beach Road

Toni..Please consult with Jim Turner regarding the value calculation..thanks.

*Bill Lorenz*

*William D. Lorenz Jr., P.E., Director  
Land Development Services Department  
Growth Management Division/Planning and Regulation  
Tele: 239.252.2951; Fax: 239.252.6710  
E-mail: [WilliamLorenz@Colliergov.net](mailto:WilliamLorenz@Colliergov.net)*

---

**From:** ValeraCarolina  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 30, 2011 5:32 PM  
**To:** MottToni  
**Cc:** LorenzWilliam; BellowsRay; BosiMichael; WileyRobert  
**Subject:** Public bathrooms at the end of Vanderbilt Beach Road

Toni,

During our telephone conversation yesterday, you mentioned that you were interested in knowing what LDC provisions may apply if the scope of the improvements to the beach public bathrooms on Vanderbilt Beach Road were limited to interior renovations and perhaps re-painting.

I Checked with Ray Bellows, Zoning Manager, and Robert Wiley, Principal Project Manager, and it seems that such scope may only require a building permit approval.

However, please keep in mind that FEMA requirements are triggered when the improvements reach 50% of the assessed value of the subject building (exclusive of the parking garage, which is within the same site). Also note that "assessed value" is not meant to be the "property appraiser's" assessed value, but the cost of the existing bathroom building regardless of its location (please contact Robert Wiley for further clarifications.); and that the building permit may (or may not) trigger other requirements if the y improvements are beyond the existing permit and variance.

As I mentioned in our telephone conversation, we will be glad to meet with your consultants to go over specific LDC requirements that may be triggered by other options that your consultant may be (or will be) considering.

Please let us know if you need further clarifications, or if you have any other questions.

Hope this helps,

CAROLINA VALERA  
Principal Planner  
Comprehensive Planning Section  
Growth Management Division  
Collier County Government  
T:239.252.8498 F:239.252.6347

---

Under Florida Law, e-mail addresses are public records. If you do not want your e-mail address released in response to a public records request, do not send electronic mail to this entity. Instead, contact this office by telephone or in writing.



**Victor J. Latavish Architect, PA**

April 2, 2011

Collier County Coastal Zone Management  
Attn: Clint Perryman, Project Manager  
3301 East Tamiami Trail  
Naples, Florida 34112

Re: **Proposal for Professional A/E Services for the  
Vanderbilt Beach Restroom Alternative Design Studies**

Dear Mr. Perryman,

I am pleased to submit this proposal for professional Architectural services to provide alternative design studies for the Vanderbilt Beach Restroom. This proposal includes preparation of preliminary building layouts and preliminary cross sections suitable for overlay on aerial photographs and site plans prepared by the Civil Engineer, plus preparation of the following documents and related work:

1. Existing Restroom Facility- Structural Inspection and Renovation Feasibility Report
  - a. Review plans of existing facility
  - b. Review building permit documents
  - c. On-site observations of existing structure
  - d. Prepare a Structural Inspection and Renovation Feasibility Report
2. A/E Zone Alternative- Preliminary Design Study
  - a. Prepare preliminary building plan and preliminary cross-section
  - b. Review plan, permit considerations, and proposed budget with County staff
3. Refurbish Existing Beach Restroom and Expand Facilities at Parking Garage
  - a. Preliminary plan of restrooms added to existing parking garage
  - b. Review refurbishing plan, expansion plan, permit considerations, and proposed budget with County staff
4. VE-Zone At-Grade Alternative
  - a. Prepare preliminary building plan and preliminary cross-section
  - b. Review plan, permit considerations, and proposed budget with County staff
5. VE-Zone Elevated Structure Alternative
  - a. Prepare preliminary building plan and preliminary cross-section, including ramps, stairs, and elevator design study
  - b. Review plan, permit considerations, and proposed budget with County staff

6. Beach Storage Renovation Design Study
  - a. Review selective demolition requirements
  - b. Review plan, permit considerations, and proposed budget with County staff
7. Coordination
  - a. Predesign Conference with Civil Engineer, FEMA, and Building Official
  - b. Coordinate preliminary plans with Civil Engineer
8. Meetings
  - a. Attend 4 progress meetings and/or community meetings as requested by client
  - b. Attend 1 BCC meeting
9. Contingency
  - a. Prepare alternative plans or revisions
  - b. Related additional services

#### EXCLUSIONS

1. Civil Engineering services are provided under a separate contract.
2. This proposal does not include detailed floor plans, exterior elevations, or renderings which can be developed for the selected alternative at a later date. Similarly, Contract Documents used for permits, bidding, and construction can be developed for the selected alternative at a later date.

#### SCHEDULE

We are prepared to provide services as needed to meet your schedule.

#### BASIC SERVICES FEE SCHEDULE:

1. Existing Building- Inspection & Renovation Report	T&M est.	\$1,810.00
2. A/E Zone Alternative- Preliminary Design Study	T&M est.	\$1,510.00
3. Refurbish Beach Restroom & Parking Garage Alternative	T&M est.	\$1,140.00
4. VE-Zone At-Grade Alternative	T&M est.	\$940.00
5. VE-Zone Elevated Structure Alternative	T&M est.	\$940.00
6. Beach Storage Renovation Design Study	T&M est.	\$370.00
7. Coordination	T&M est.	\$680.00
8. Meetings	T&M est.	\$1,480.00
9. Contingency	T&M est.	\$850.00
10. Reimbursable Expenses	T&M est.	\$80.00
Total		<u>\$9,800.00</u>



Thank you for the opportunity to submit this Proposal for Professional A/E Services.  
Please feel free to call if you have any questions or if additional information is needed.

Sincerely,

VICTOR J. LATAVISH ARCHITECT, PA

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Victor J. Latavish", written in a cursive style.

Victor J. Latavish, AIA  
President

PROJECT NAME: VANDERBILT BEACH RESTROOM ALTERNATIVES ANALYSIS

CEC PROJECT NO: 10.192

DATE OF ISSUANCE: April 1, 2011

EFFECTIVE DATE: April 1, 2011

---

CLIENT: Collier County

PROJECT MANAGER: Michael Poff

---

Coastal Engineering Consultants, Inc. (CEC) is hereby directed to provide the following services in connection with the Vanderbilt Beach Restroom facility. This work assignment shall be conducted in accordance with the terms and conditions of our Continuing Contract for Professional Engineering Services for Coastal Zone Management Projects (CONTRACT) No. **09-5262**.

### **SCOPE OF SERVICES**

The scope of services presented herein is designed to assist Collier County's Coastal Zone Management (CZM) Department review alternatives in connection with the renovation and / or expansion of the Vanderbilt Beach restroom facility. For Tasks I to VI below, the evaluations for each option will include the following parameters as well as coordination with CZM's architect:

1. Environmental Impacts (e.g. T&E species, dune vegetation, wetlands, mangroves);
2. Rules and Regulations (e.g. FEMA, ADA, federal/state/local regulatory);
3. Institutional (e.g., distance to MHW, specific uses);
4. Construction Budget (site work, mitigation, design and permitting, and construction management); and
5. Timing (e.g. FEMA flood zone map revision, permit processes).

#### **Task I Renovate Existing Facility**

To be completed by the County's Architect.

#### **Task II Construct New Facility in Proposed AE Zone**

Develop a concept plan and evaluate the option to construct a new facility at grade in the proposed AE Zone as depicted on the proposed FEMA flood zone map to be provided by CZM. The facility will include restrooms, access ramps / stairs, decks on the west and north sides, and storage areas for beach items like chairs, and umbrellas. This is within the preserve area.

#### **Task III Refurbish Existing Bathroom and Expand Bathrooms in Garage**

Develop a concept plan and evaluate the option to refurbish the existing facility (Task 1 option) and add additional bathrooms in the parking garage. This plan will include an elevated boardwalk through the preserve area from the existing facility to the garage.

#### **Task IV Construct Reduced Facility at Grade in VE Zone**

Develop a concept plan and evaluate the option to demolish the existing facility and construct a new facility at grade in the VE Zone. The facility will include restrooms, ADA access ramp, steps, and reduced deck.

#### **Task V Construct Reduced Elevated Facility in VE Zone**

Develop a concept plan and evaluate the option to demolish the existing facility and construct a new elevated facility in the VE Zone. The facility will include restrooms, ADA access ramps, stairs, and reduced deck. Investigate the feasibility of using an elevator versus ramps for ADA access to the new facility.

#### **Task VI Renovate Existing Bathroom for Concession Storage**

In conjunction with a new bathroom facility, develop a concept plan to renovate the existing bathroom for concession storage. This would include storage for chairs, umbrellas, shade structures, etc. but would not include food and beverage items.

**Task VII Client Coordination**

Provide client coordination including attending two meetings with County; provide contract administration.

**Task VIII BCC Presentation**

CEC will assist prepare and present the alternatives analysis to the BCC.

**Task IX Contingencies**

Provide budget for contingencies to account for such things as an additional concept, an additional meeting or revisions to concept plans.

**Task X Reimbursable Expenses**

Provide budget for reimbursables.

It is anticipated that upon selection of the preferred alternative, additional design and related services will be necessary thus they are reserved for future phases. It is understood the County will address the FEMA-LOMR services and the County's Architect will complete the structural inspection of the existing structure.

**BUDGET SUMMARY**

Task	Description	Fee	Basis
I	Renovate Existing Facility	\$0	T&M
II	Construct New Facility in Proposed AE Zone	\$5,659	T&M
III	Refurbish Existing Bathroom & Expand Bathrooms in Garage	\$2,274	T&M
IV	Construct Reduced Facility at Grade in VE Zone	\$2,789	T&M
V	Construct Reduced Elevated Facility in VE Zone	\$2,136	T&M
VI	Renovate Existing Bathroom for Concession Storage	\$610	T&M
VII	Client Coordination	\$1,290	T&M
VIII	BCC Presentation	\$2,405	T&M
IX	Contingencies	\$2,616	T&M
X	Reimbursables	\$150	T&M
<b>Total</b>		<b>\$19,929</b>	

RECOMMENDED:

By: \_\_\_\_\_  
 Michael T. Poff, P.E.

Date: April 1, 2011

APPROVED:

By: \_\_\_\_\_  
 Client (Authorized Signature)

Date: \_\_\_\_\_