

September 1, 2016

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COLLIER COUNTY
GROWTH MANAGEMENT OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE**

Naples, Florida, September 1, 2016

LET IT BE REMEMBERED, the Collier County Development Growth Management Oversight Committee in and for the County of Collier, having conducted business herein, met on this date at 3:00 P.M. in REGULAR SESSION at the Collier County Growth Management Department Building, Conference Room #609/610, 2800 N. Horseshoe Drive, Naples, Florida, with the following members present:

**Chairman: Ross W. McIntosh
Vice Chairman: Nicholas G. Penniman, IV
Jeffery Curl
Everett Loukonen
John W. Vaughn, Jr. (Excused)
Max Weisinger
(Vacancy)**

**ALSO PRESENT: Kris Van Lengen, Community Planning Manager
Anita Jenkins, Principal Planner**

Any persons in need of the verbatim record of the meeting may request a copy of the audio recording from the Collier County Growth Management Department – Contact Mr. Evy Ybaceta at 239-252-2400.

1. Roll Call

Chairman McIntosh called the meeting to order at 3:15pm

2. Approval of Agenda

Mr. Curl moved to approve the Agenda. Second by Mr. Penniman. Carried unanimously 5 - 0.

3. Approval of Minutes from June 2, 2016 Meeting

Mr. Penniman moved to approve the minutes of the June 2, 2016 meeting as presented. Second by Mr. Weisinger. Carried unanimously 5 - 0.

4. Staff Announcements

Mr. Van Lengen reported:

- Assisted Living Facilities are considered commercial uses under the Land Development Code (LDC) given they have a commercial kitchen.
- 1,000 Friends of Florida will host a Webinar “*Florida Sprawl Development by 2070*” on 9/21/16 from 12:00pm – 1:30pm and any interested party should contact Staff on the event.

5. Agenda Items

A. Recommendation to the Board of County Commissioners to Fill the Vacancy on the GMOC Chairman and members

Mr. Van Lengen reported *Andrea Psaras, James Horner, Jacob Winge, Ajay Pandey, John Levy and Michael Lyster* have submitted applications seeking appointment to the Committee.

Mr. Penniman noted all the applicants are highly qualified and could be seated on the Committee, however in the interest in diversification, suggested a female be considered for the position.

Mr. Penniman moved to recommend the Board of County Commissioners appoint Andrea Psaras to the Growth Management Oversight Committee. Second by Chairman McIntosh.

Mr. Weisinger did not object but noted all the applicants have ample, but different qualifications and suggested **Mr. Lyster** be considered.

Chairman McIntosh called for a vote.

The motion carried 3 “yes” and 2 “no.” Mr. Weisinger and Mr. Loukonen voted “no.”

B. Presentation on Collier County’s Affordable Housing Initiatives Stephen J. Hrubby, Affordable Housing Advisory Committee

Steve Hrubby, Chairman Affordable Housing Committee provided an update on their activities noting:

- There is year long initiative underway to develop a plan for the provision of affordable housing which includes engaging a consultant to analyze the existing data and provide recommendations on strategies to improve the supply of the housing.
- A major issue is workforce wages in the area are not high enough to support costs of housing for those providing services to the area.

- Issues include the high cost of land, Land Development Code (LDC) regulations, the level of impact fees, and ensuring there is a “political will” to address the problem.
- The consultant’s analysis will provide recommendations on the type and location for the housing and incentives to develop it.
- In addition, the Urban Land Institute (ULI) may be conducting a study in the area which would consist of a week long visit to the area with provision of an “exit report” followed by a final report within 60 days.
- There is a high demand for rental housing and shelter for the elderly, fixed income and disabled residents.

During Committee discussion the following was noted:

- The original thought was the consultant engaged by the County would conduct the work proposed for the ULI; however the concept now would be for the consultant to provide recommendations on how to implement any recommendations developed.
- Another issue is the lack of expertise in the current development community to build this type of housing given the current environment is characterized by large track, gated community type construction.
- Mr. Hruba was not fully aware of the Committee’s activities until recently and will be coordinating with Staff on the housing issue and its relationship to the plans being considered by the Committee.
- The will to address the issue is increasing as many of those parties directly affected by the shortage are requesting action by the Board of County Commissioners (BCC).
- The housing should be located in relative close proximity to the areas in need of the workforce to help control impacts on the transportation network, etc.

Speaker

Susan O’ Neil noted one segment being affected besides low income individuals are the middle income young professionals and queried if there is a list available of the affordable housing projects that have been constructed in the County.

C. Report on Rural Fringe- White Paper and Restudy Status Kris Van Lengen, Community Planning Manager Anita Jenkins, Principal Planner

Mr. Van Lengen presented the “*Rural Fringe Mixed-Use District Restudy White Paper*” and PowerPoint “*Restudy Update Growth Management Oversight Committee*” for information purposes. Staff presented the PowerPoint to the Collier County Planning Commission on 8/18/16 who appreciated the direction the County is taking and would reserve official comment until such time the Growth Management Plan (GMP)/LDC amendments, etc. are proposed by the various parties. The White Paper includes 39 recommendations and 3 major concepts which the BCC will need to provide direction on as follows:

1. Mitigation Bank

- The South Belle Meade area performs well given there is an entity (Picayune Strand State Forest) which manages ownership of the lands.
- There is currently no similar entity available in North Belle Meade to manage these type lands and a majority of Stakeholders view a ROMA (Regional Offsite Mitigation Area) as one solution to the issue.
- The bank would provide a source of funds for long term maintenance, allow a “conveyance TDR” for owners of sending lands, promote long term cost savings to the

County for transportation projects requiring mitigation and improve water quality for the area.

- Initial investigation indicates the concept appears feasible however the BCC will need to provide direction on if, and how to proceed.

2. TDR Bank

- The GMP states the County “shall consider a TDR bank” which has not been officially proposed to date.
- The Bank would signal a County commitment to the sending land owners, provide a timely monetary return to sending land owners and provide readily available credits for owners of receiving lands.
- The major issue is how to fund the endeavor including a instituting a dedicated millage to the endeavor.
- If implemented, the Bank would be phased out when it is no longer needed.

Mr. Curl left at 4:20pm

3. Density

- The concept involves increasing densities to create an environment for mixed use villages.
- The villages would promote healthier communities, reduce the burden on transportation networks and appeal to younger working individuals who prefer a more social type of residential development within walking distance to commercial uses.
- More diverse housing opportunities would be created by allowing 7 units per acre and possibly increase the number of TDR credits allowed for owners of sending lands.
- One incentive for developing these types of projects is the high rate of return on the investment.

Mr. Penniman consulted an expert who has experience with TDR programs in Maryland and he relayed 3 key features for a successful program:

1. *The need for a strict regulatory environment of land use with no variances available.*
2. *The development areas need to be carefully pre-selected and not open ended areas.*
3. *A TDR “bank” and the administration of the program need to be operated by the same entity (i.e. County, etc.).*

Discussion occurred noting agriculture land use in neutral areas is currently ineligible for the TDR’s, however the proposal moving forward is to allow these areas the ability to utilize the process.

Speakers

Nicole Johnson, Conservancy of Southwest Florida reported Staff worked closely with stakeholders and was amenable to comments proposed. They support the concept of a TDR bank; however have reservations on the ROMA concept until further investigation occurs. Transportation networks should be a major consideration in the Golden Gate Estates areas given there potential impacts on the demands for future land uses.

Neville Williams, Collier Citizens Council supports the Conservancy’s positions and 38 of the 39 recommendations proposed by Staff in the White Paper. He disseminated some recent newspaper

articles (8/11/16, *Naples Daily News* – “*Smart Growth Vision for Easter Collier County,*” 9/1/16, *Naples Daily News* “*Some Advice for Collier Commissioners*”) for information purposes.

Bill McDaniel recommended: Consideration be given to allowing transfer of TDR credits out of the rural fringe and into the urban areas or RLSA areas; ensure the land use regulations for the receiving areas do not unintentionally hinder transfer of the credits; ensure plans under review are interconnected and develop clear definitions and separate criteria for “affordable housing” (those for labor workforce, professional service, first responder, etc.); consider deed restricted programs with reduced housing prices with possible density bonuses for the developer.

Committee discussion occurred over the avenues available to ensure ongoing coordination between the four areas of restudy given some issues may overlap between plans (i.e. TDR program). Staff noted:

- The White Paper may be revised as necessary moving forward given the remaining plans to be reviewed (Immokalee Area Master Plan, Golden Gate Area Master Plan, Rural Lands Stewardship Area) may have an impact on the TDR Program.
- Although the plans will be moving the process at different times, they will be coordinated to the extent possible given any official amendments for each plan is a long term endeavor.
- Even after adoption of the Plans, or any subsequent LDC amendments there is always opportunities to amend the documents over time as necessary.

**D. Golden Gate Area Master Plan: Next Steps Kris Van Lengen, Community Planning Manager
Anita Jenkins, Principal Planner**

Staff reported there will be a second round of public outreach including 10/6/16 Golden Gate Estates and 10/13/16 in Golden Gate City and Staff will be expanding outreach efforts in the area to help ensure those interested in providing input are aware of the schedule. Given the diversity of the region, it is anticipated there will be different visions developed for each area of impact.

E. Four Restudies: Progression and Coordination All

Staff recommended, and the Committee agreed to hear the Immokalee Area Master Plan following the Golden Gate Restudies given the US Fish and Wildlife Service is in the process of developing a Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP) for the Rural Land Stewardship Area (RLSA).

Speakers

Nicole Johnson supports reviewing the RLSA plan last given the HCP will provide a vast amount of information relative to the area.

Bill McDaniel expressed concern on separately adopting the plans/amendments associated with the areas of restudy given their interconnectivity.

Staff noted they are aware of the issue and one avenue to address the concern is to develop broad based Growth Management Plan Amendments first, followed by the LDC amendments.

Additionally, to aid in ensuring connectivity timing between the adoptions of new standards, it may be advantageous to relocate some items currently addressed in the GMP to the LDC.

6. Member and Citizen Comments (topics not covered)

None

7. Next meeting date (December, 2016)

September 1, 2016

The next meeting will be held on December 1, 2016.

There being no further business for the good of the County, the meeting was adjourned by the order of the Chair at 5:30PM.

**COLLIER COUNTY GROWTH MANAGEMENT
OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE**



Chairman, Ross W. McIntosh

These Minutes were approved by the Board/Chairman on December 1, as presented _____, or as amended ✓.