

1.5.K - Brief Assessment of Successes & Shortcomings – Marco Island Master Plan Element

A. Introduction & Background:

In 1994, the Collier County Board of County Commissioners authorized Comprehensive Planning staff to initiate preparation of a Marco Island Master Plan (MIMP), similar in scope to those previously created for the Golden Gate and Immokalee Areas. Throughout the period between February 14, 1995 (Committee Creation) and November 12, 1996 (Draft Plan Completion), staff worked with the Board-appointed Marco Island Vision Planning Advisory Committee to develop the Draft Master Plan Element. The Board of County Commissioners adopted the Element in early 1997.

Meanwhile, various civic groups on Marco Island had been working with the Florida Legislature to achieve incorporation of Marco Island as a city. The City of Marco Island was incorporated on August 29, 1997. The only portion of the County's Marco Island planning area that remained under County jurisdiction was the island of Key Marco.

B. Objectives Analysis:

As Key Marco is the only portion of the Marco Island Master Plan Area currently remaining under Collier County jurisdiction, staff analyzed the Objectives within the MIMP to determine which, if any, should be removed to the Countywide Future Land Use Element. Results of the analysis follow:

Objective I.1:

Within one year of the Plan's effective date, the county will cause to have made, accurate annual estimates of the dwelling units and the population residing on Marco Island. These estimates are to be made for both the peak (February) and minimum (August) seasons. The population estimates will include residents, renters, and hotel guests. The estimate will be consistent with the methodology used to determine population listed in the support documents.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

The tasks stated in the Objective were never performed. Within one year of adoption of the Master Plan, the City of Marco Island had been incorporated and the Master Plan was no longer valid. The County recommends deletion of this Objective.

Policy Relevance:

Policies I.1.1 through I.1.3 support the Objective by outlining the intended use of collected demographic information. These policies should be deleted.

Objective II.1:

New, revised, or redeveloped uses of land shall be consistent with the designations shown on the Marco Island Future Land Use Map. The Future Land Use Map and companion Future Land Use Designations and Districts shall be binding on all Development Orders effective with the finding of compliance by the Florida Department of Community Affairs of the Master Plan for Marco Island.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

This Objective and its policies require all future land use designations within the Master Plan Area to be consistent with the Marco Island Future Land Use Map and the Future Land Use Designation Section contained within the MIMP. For reasons stated below, this Objective should be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

Policy II.1.1 requires Marco Island to maintain a gross density of 4 units per acre, and to be considered as being within the County's Urban Coastal Fringe Future Land Use Designation. Staff notes that Key Marco is thus already contained within this designation, which is identical to the similar designation within the Countywide FLUE. Therefore, staff recommends deletion of this policy. Policy II.1.2 lists the future land use districts within the MIMP. The Future Land Use Map shows Key Marco as being within the Low Residential and Preservation/Conservation Districts. The Marco Island Future Land Use Map indicates that density within the Low Residential District may not exceed 4 units per acre. As this is identical to that contained within the County's Urban Coastal Fringe Subdistrict, staff recommends deletion of this policy. Policy II.1.3 and Policy II.1.4 relate to geographic areas that are no longer under County jurisdiction and should, therefore be deleted. Policy II.1.5 refers to an Overlay District described in the Master Plan, and should be deleted. Policy II.1.6 limits density to 4 units per acre until standards for multi-family development within planning districts on Marco Island proper are adopted. This policy should be deleted.

Objective II.2:

Development and design standards for Marco Island will create a tropical small town character.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

Due to the incorporation of the City, the referenced development and design standards were never developed and are no longer the responsibility of Collier County. Therefore, this Objective should be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

There are two policies within this Objective, as well as the Future Land Use Designation Section. Policy II.2.1 requires the development of an overlay, or other appropriate methods, to establish development guidelines for several areas of Marco Island. Staff recommends deletion of this policy, as the referenced areas are no longer under County jurisdiction. Policy II.2.2 requires development of a residential overlay for appropriate areas of Marco Island. The County’s Zoning Maps designate portions of Key Marco as being within the Rural Agricultural Zoning District, subject to a “Marco Island Zoning Overlay.” However, a discussion with County Zoning staff reveals that the Overlay was discarded at the time of incorporation. Therefore, zoning determinations rely on the underlying Rural Agricultural (A) District. Therefore, staff recommends deletion of this policy. In this regard, staff also notes that portions of Key Marco are subject to the provisions of the Marco Shores Development of Regional Impact/PUD. Therefore, this Objective and its policies should be deleted.

Future Land Uses Designation Description Section:

Within the Marco Island Master Plan Area and Future Land Use Map, only two of the original land use Districts remain in effect. Areas covered by the remaining designations are now within the City of Marco Island.

Low-Density Residential District:

Residential dwelling shall be limited to single-family structures. Non-residential uses permitted within this district are limited to those uses that are compatible and/or support the residential character of the area. The allowed uses include: parks, open space and recreational uses, churches, libraries, cemeteries, schools, day-care centers, family care facilities, and essential services as defined in the Land Development Code. A density less than or equal to four (4) dwelling units per gross acre is permitted.

Preservation/Conservation District:

The purpose of this district is to preserve and conserve natural resources and habitat on privately or publicly owned land. Uses permitted within this district include passive parks, nature trails, nature preserves, and wildlife sanctuaries.

This section also includes a density bonus provision for affordable housing. The provision allows a maximum of eight (8) dwelling units per gross acre above the maximum density of the district (4 units per acre); however, no density may exceed twelve (12) units per acre except when Transfer of Development Rights (TDR) are applied. However, this bonus provision does not appear to apply to the Low-Density Residential District.

Section Relevance:

The provisions contained within the Countywide FLUE's Urban Coastal Fringe Subdistrict are virtually equivalent to those within the Marco Island Master Plan's Low-Density Residential District. However, the Urban Coastal Fringe Subdistrict allows density bonus for affordable housing and TDR use, whereas the Low-Density Residential District does not allow these bonuses. Therefore, the County recommends incorporation of Key Marco into the Countywide Urban Coastal Fringe Subdistrict, but with the provision that only an Affordable Housing Bonus of +1 may be used in this area.

The MIMP's Preservation/Conservation District is more restrictive than the County's Conservation Designation. Therefore, the County recommends that the Key Marco Preservation/Conservation Areas be incorporated into the Countywide Conservation Designation as the "Key Marco Preservation/Conservation District," retaining the same wording as is currently in place (in the MIMP).

Objective III.1:

The County will assure that all federal and state requirements and the designated level of service standards are met by the suppliers of potable water to Marco Island.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

The purpose of this Objective was to require periodic monitoring, by the County, of the potable water utilities serving Marco Island. The Goodland Subdistrict of the Collier County Water & Sewer District currently provides potable water to Key Marco. The County recommends the Objective be deleted, because similar requirements are included in the County's Potable Water Subelement.

Policy Relevance:

Policy III.1.1, the Objective's only policy, requires County staff to obtain quarterly reports from potable water utility providers to Marco Island. This policy should be deleted, as the County is the provider for Key Marco.

Objective III.2:

Within one year from the date of Plan's effective date, a comprehensive program will be implemented for the Marco Island area, that will reduce the per capita consumption of water from the actual 290 gallons per day to 200 gallons per day which is the LOS in the Growth Management Plan.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

Key Marco per capita water consumption is subject to the Goals, Objectives, Policies and programs outlined within the County's potable water sub-element. Therefore, the County recommends deletion of this Objective.

Policy Relevance:

Policy III.2.1 requires the County to support the potable water supplier's conservation program. Policy III.2.2 mandates a reduction of the amount of sod utilized within residential landscape plans and encourages the use of native and drought-tolerant vegetation. Policy III.2.3 requires the County to "encourage" the establishment of a reclaimed water service on Marco Island. Policy III.2.4 requires the County to pass an irrigation restriction ordinance for Marco Island. All of these policies appear to apply to the now-incorporated portion of the Master Plan Map and should be deleted.

Objective III.3:

The County shall support the potable water supplier's efforts to expand the capacity and dependability of the existing facility.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

This Objective relates to facilities currently contained within the City of Marco Island and should be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

Policy III.3.1 requires the County to encourage the potable water utility to provide an adequate water supply. Policy III.3.2 requires the County to encourage the water supplier to increase the ability of the facility to recover from a Category 3 hurricane. Policy III.3.3 requires the County to encourage expansion of the private water utility. All of these policies refer to the incorporated area of Marco Island and should be deleted.

Objective III.4:

The County will work closely with the policy-making agencies, such as the Big Cypress Basin and the South Florida Water Management District, to assure that the residents of Marco Island have access to the water resources.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

The thrust of this Objective is unclear. However, from a careful reading of Policy III.4.1, it appears that County staff is required to ask the Big Cypress Basin Board and the Water Management District to demonstrate that they are spending funds generated from Marco Island taxes on Marco Island water needs. This Objective relates to facilities currently contained within the City of Marco Island and should be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

Policy III.4.1 should be deleted (see above).

Objective IV.1:

The County will encourage that wastewater treatment, collection, treatment and disposal facilities are made available to correct any possible deficiencies and to meet future growth, that meet or exceed the level of service standards established in this plan.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

Key Marco receives wastewater treatment service from the City of Marco Island, via an interlocal service agreement with Collier County. As such, the wastewater service is subject to the requirements contained in the County's Sanitary Sewer Sub-element. Therefore, the Objective may be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

Policy IV.1.1 sets the Marco Island wastewater treatment LOS at 100 gallons per capita per day. As this Policy is consistent with the County's LOS for the Goodland Subdistrict, the policy may be deleted. Policy IV.1.2 requires the County Health Department to request that the Florida Department of Environmental Protection annually test fecal coliform levels in the coastal waters around Marco Island. Policy IV.1.3 requires similar testing within Marco Island Area canals. These tasks are covered under procedures instituted through the Collier County Pollution Control Department. Therefore, these two policies should be deleted. Policy IV.1.4 concerns the use of the fecal coliform test results related to the previous policies. This should be deleted. Policy IV.1.5 requires the County to hold a wastewater treatment funding referendum for Marco Island residents. The County's wastewater treatment system is funded through ad Valorem taxation. Therefore, the County recommends that this policy be deleted. Policy IV.1.6 requires the County to encourage the State Health Department to conduct a public educational campaign regarding septic tank use. This policy has no force, as the County cannot make requirements upon the State in this regard. Also, it could be accomplished administratively, without policy direction. Therefore, the policy should be deleted.

Objective IV.2:

The County, to the best of its ability, will promote the use of treated wastewater effluent for irrigation purposes in order to provide an environmentally sound disposal method and to conserve potable water and ground water supplies by developing an implementing an integrated, comprehensive strategy for the following policies.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

A review of the subject policies reveals that this Objective is calling for the establishment of a reclaimed water irrigation system for Marco Island. As this Objective is related to the incorporated area, it should be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

Policy IV.2.1 requires the County to encourage the service provider to install a reclaimed water system on Marco Island. Policy IV.2.2 requires the County to coordinate installation of the reclaimed water system. Policy IV.2.3 requires coordination of the reclaimed water facilities with the island's streetscape plan. None of these policies were intended to encompass Key Marco and should therefore be deleted.

Objective V.1:

The Marco Island Future Traffic Circulation Map shall supersede the Future Traffic Circulation Map found in the Growth Management Plan as it applies to Marco Island and it will be used as a frame work to guide the future roadway planning on Marco Island.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

A review of the Traffic Circulation Map of the Marco Island Master Plan reveals that it does not include Key Marco. Therefore, this Objective and its policies should be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

Policy V.1.1 limits the expansion of the number of road lanes on the island, due to traffic improvements. Policy V.1.2 requires road capacity to be improved by the year 2000, through a concentration on intersection improvements. Policy V.1.3 requires all Island roadways to be resurfaced by December 1998. As none of these policies apply to Key Marco, they all should be deleted.

Objective V.2:

To facilitate a smooth flow of traffic at safe speeds on all parts of Marco Island.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

This Objective does not include Key Marco and should therefore be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

Policy V.2.1 requires roadway travel lanes not to exceed 12 feet in width. Policy V.2.2 requires the installation of traffic calming techniques/features on Marco Island roadways.

Policy V.2.3 refers to roadway, sidewalk and driveway design standards. As none of these policies apply to Key Marco, they all should be deleted.

Objective V.3:

The 24 miles of roads identified on the Marco Island Facility Map will be modified to correct existing deficiencies and to enhance traffic movement.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

As the facility map does not include Key Marco, the County recommends that this Objective be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

Policy V.3.1 lists elements for a conceptual design/streetscape plan. Policy V.3.2 requires that the County hold a referendum, for Marco Island residents, regarding establishment of a road improvement-funding source. Policy V.3.3 extends a County traffic management program to Marco Island. However, as the Objective and policies are related to the facility map, and the map does not include Key Marco, these items should be deleted.

Objective V.4:

All roadway modifications will be coordinated with other capital improvements.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

A review of the single policy indicates that this Objective calls for coordination of capital improvements with the previously mentioned streetscape plan. Since the latter plan does not include Key Marco, this Objective should be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

Policy V.4.1 refers to a study regarding coordination of other improvements with the proposed streetscape plan. As this policy only relates to Marco Island proper (now an independent municipality), it should be deleted.

Objective V.5:

To complete a continuous bicycle and pedestrian transportation system by January 1, 2000.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

This Objective and its policies are related to a map of the “Marco Island Future Bicycle and Pedestrian System.” As the map only includes the current City of Marco Island, this Objective and its policies should be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

Policies V.5.1 through V.5.8 all refer to aspects of the planned “Marco Island Future Bicycle and Pedestrian System.” Therefore, these policies should be deleted.

Objective V.6:

To provide a convenient, comfortable, secure, safe and efficient transportation system for pedestrian and bicycle trips.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

This Objective refers to certain general roadway and sidewalk design improvements that promote pedestrian and bicycle safety. This Objective is only applicable to Marco Island proper and should therefore be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

These policies (V.6.1 through V.6.4) refer to various roadway and sidewalk design improvements that promote pedestrian and bicycle safety. This Objective is only applicable to Marco Island proper and should therefore be deleted.

Objective V.7:

To reduce the need for single occupant automobile trips through strong incentives provided in support of walking, bicycling and transit.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

Language similar to Objective V.7 is contained within the County’s Transportation Element. Therefore, this Objective should be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

Policies V.7.1 and V.7.2 refer to bicycle and pedestrian support facilities. Once again, language regarding such support facilities is contained within the County’s Transportation Element. Therefore, these policies should be deleted.

Objective V.8:

To encourage & promote public transportation to satisfy the trip making demands of Marco Island’s tourists, employees, and residents.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

The nature of the subject policies within this Objective indicates that it refers to Marco Island proper, which is incorporated. Therefore, this Objective should be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

Policy V.8.1 calls for the development of a transit master plan for Marco Island. Policy V.8.2 requires the County to address increased transportation demands from Marco Island through institution of a public transit system. Policy V.8.3 requires any developed transit system to operate in such manner as to protect Island’s environment. Policy V.8.4 requires the County to evaluate alternative fuel technologies for use in Marco Island transit vehicles. Policy V.8.5 requires an amendment to the County’s Land Development Code, to allow creation of geometric design criteria for the transit system. Policy V.8.6 requires the County to develop land use incentives to promote construction of portions of the transit system by local developers. A Countywide transit system, with specific objectives and policies is currently in place. Therefore, these policies should be deleted.

Objective V.9:

To provide for the safe and predictable movement of pedestrians, bicyclists and motorists.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

The policies contained within this Objective emphasize transportation safety concerns. As these are dealt with in Objective 4 of the adopted Countywide Transportation Element and, as the Objective does not identify area-specific safety issues, it should be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

These five policies all deal with the establishment or continuance of safety information programs for bicyclists, pedestrians and motorists. Staff believes that the Collier County Metropolitan Planning Organization, along with the Collier County Traffic Operations & Alternative Transportation Modes Department make available adequate public safety information to all County residents, from Marco Island or otherwise. Also, the Objective and its policies seem to relate mainly to the primary Marco Island Area, which is now within the City of Marco Island. Therefore, Policies V.9.1 through V.9.5 should be deleted.

Objective VI.1:

To develop additional recreational and open space sites on Marco Island and maintain and enhance the existing sites.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

Currently, the County Parks & Recreation Department operates four (4) parks on Marco Island, all of which provide beach and/or boat access. Future development of park/recreational sites will be the responsibility of the City of Marco Island. Therefore, this Objective should be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

Policy VI.1.1 requires the County to investigate and negotiate the purchase of park-suitable property on Marco Island. Policy VI.1.2 and Policy VI.1.3 concern the purchase of two specific properties on Marco Island and their development as park sites. Policy VI.1.4 requires the County Parks & Recreation Department to hold public meetings on Marco Island to seek residents' input on the design of public recreational facilities. Policy VI.1.5 requires the County to seek beach access easements across undeveloped residential and commercial properties. Policy VI.1.6 requires the County to create a "Marco Island Community Park Impact Fee District." Policy VI.1.7 requires a re-evaluation of Marco Island Public Recreational facilities to see that they are compatible with the policies contained in this Element. Policy VI.1.8 requires the County to evaluate the potential for expansion of various recreational facilities. Policy VI.1.9 requires the County to investigate the possibility of allowing pets at some recreational facilities on Marco Island. All of these policies concern the incorporated portion of Marco Island and therefore these should be deleted.

Objective VI.2:

Ensure that public access to beaches and waterways of Marco Island are maximized and maintained.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

As mentioned above, the County maintains four parks (having beach and boating access) on Marco Island. The County Parks & Recreation Department also operates joint beach parking programs with the City through an interlocal agreement. Beach and boating access programs are also covered within the County's Recreation & Open Space Element. Therefore, this Objective should be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

There are four (4) policies within this Objective. Policy VI.2.1 requires the County to investigate acquisition of a specific beach access point. Policy VI.2.2 requires development of a Beachfront Management Plan for Marco Island. Policy VI.2.3 and Policy VI.2.4 require local referenda on waterway interconnections and waterway navigation maintenance. All of these policies are the responsibility of the City of Marco Island, and therefore they should be deleted from the Collier County Growth Management Plan.

Objective VII.1:

The following list of projects and schedule (Table 1.5K-1) will be used as a frame work to guide the future capital improvements that will improve and replace existing infrastructure in order to enhance the tropical small town environment of Marco Island:

1. Design and construction of a reclaimed water line to provide 2 million gallons of water per day to appropriate customers. Design Phase will begin within one year after funding source has been identified and construction will be completed by the year 2000.
2. If the water quality study indicates a high level of fecal coliform, and based on referendum results, it is the desire of Marco Island Residents to install the sewer lines, then sewer collection lines will be installed on the island. Design Phase will begin within one year of determination of need. The system, if warranted, will be completed by the year 2000.
3. Design and construction of a sub-surface piped drainage system as defined in the conceptual design/streetscape plan to serve the major roadways identified on the Future Traffic Circulation Map. Design will begin within one year of the completion of the conceptual/design plan and the funding source is identified. Construction will be completed by the year 2000.
4. Design and construction of bicycle and pedestrian facilities as identified on the Marco Island Future Bicycle and Pedestrian System Map and consistent with the conceptual design/streetscape plan. Design will begin within one year of the completion of the conceptual/design plan and the funding source is identified. Construction will be completed by the year 2000.
5. Design and reconstruction of existing roadways to improve traffic circulation as determined by the conceptual design/streetscape plan. Design will begin within one year of the completion of the conceptual/design plan and the funding source is identified. Construction will be completed by the year 2000.
6. Resurfacing of all other roads that are not under the conceptual design plan by December 1998.

7. If feasible, design and construction of neighborhood park features for Tract D on Heathwood Drive. Design will begin within one year of identification of funding source. Construction will be completed by 2000.
8. If feasible, the purchase of vacant property that is suitable for future parks and/or community centers and design and construction of identified improvements on these properties. If feasible, purchase will be made as soon as funding source is identified and design and construction will be completed by the year 2000.
9. If feasible, the purchase of vacant property to create an additional beach access point, and design and construction of identified improvements. If feasible, purchase will be made within one year of identification of funding source. Design and construction will be completed by the year 2000.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

This Objective is the first within the Capital Improvement section of the Marco Island Master Plan. All of the above-referenced tasks seek to implement requirements or projects identified in other sections of the MIMP. All of these tasks relate to the incorporated area of Marco Island. Within the specified one-year period for beginning design of the referenced improvements, this area was no longer under County jurisdiction. Comprehensive Planning staff notes that the County does maintain public facilities on Marco Island, and all such facilities are covered within the County's Annual Schedule of Capital Improvements. This Objective should be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

Policy VII.1.1 concerns the initiation of the MIMP's "Conceptual Design/Streetscape Plan." Policy VII.1.2 requires that the streetscape plan and potable water and sewer line planning be incorporated into an overall construction plan, to be initiated by 1997. Policy VII.1.3 concerns identification of a funding source for capital improvements on Marco Island. Policy VII.1.4 allows for modification of project timelines due to funding constraints. All of these policies relate primarily to the incorporated area. Therefore, they should be deleted.

Objective VII.2:

Appropriate funding sources to be used exclusively on Marco Island for design, construction, and maintenance for projects listed in this Plan will be selected by referendum by the residents of Marco Island. All referendums will be scheduled consistent with countywide policies and election cycles.

Objective Achievement Analysis:

This Objective essentially requires Marco Island Area Capital Improvements to be put to public vote. This Objective has never been implemented because most of the population

of the Marco Island Master Planning Area (and thus most of the eligible voters) resides within the City of Marco Island. This Objective should be deleted.

Policy Relevance:

There are three policies under this Objective. Policy VII.2.1 requires a regularly scheduled County referendum of Marco Island residents for the purpose of selecting capital improvement funding sources. Misnumbered Policy VIII.2.2 requires the County to analyze existing funding sources (presumably at the time of Master Plan Adoption) to determine what funds can be allocated to the projects outlined in the Master Plan. Misnumbered Policy VIII.2.3 allows the Plan to be amended in response to capital improvement funding availability. As all of these policies apply primarily to the City of Marco Island, they should be deleted.

C. General Recommendation:

Based upon the outcome of the above analysis, and due to the fact that the greater part of the Marco Island Master Plan Area is now within the incorporated City of Marco Island, Comprehensive Planning staff recommends that the Marco Island Master Plan Element be deleted in its entirety. However, those portions of the Plan's Future Land Use Designation Section relating to the island of Key Marco should be amended to the Urban Coastal Fringe Subdistrict of the Countywide Future Land Use Map and Element, with appropriate language relative to unique aspects of the former Marco Island Master Plan future land use designations.

Table 1.5K-1

SCHEDULE FOR MAJOR CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS

	YEAR 1	YEAR 2	YEAR 3	YEAR 4	YEAR 5
Conceptual Studies					
<i>Reclaimed Water Lines</i>	→				
<i>Sewer Line</i>	→				
<i>Drainage System</i>	→				
<i>Beautification</i>	→				
<i>Bike Paths & Walks</i>	→				
Road Design		→			
Phase I (Roads)			→		
Phase II (Roads)				→	
Phase III (Roads)					→
Upgrade Comm. Roads		→	→	→	→
Land Procurement		→	→	→	→
Community Park		→	→	→	→
Waterway Connections		→	→	→	→
Community Center		→	→	→	→
Long Term Financing	→				
	YEAR 1	YEAR 2	YEAR 3	YEAR 4	YEAR 5